

District School Board of Pasco County

Bid Recommendation

RFP Title	Dental Services		Number of Vendors Notified	282
RFP Number	08-014-AZ		Number of Proposals Distributed	17
Date Solicited	April 19, 2007		Number of Vendors Proposing	13
Date Opened	May 17, 2007		Number of Formal “No Bid” Responses	0
Date Board Presentation	July 24, 2007		Funding Source	Group Health Insurance
Total Savings	Will report after USEP contract finalized		Grand Total of Proposal	Will report after USEP contract finalized

Recommendation: Recommend acceptance of RFP for Dental Services from SafeGuard Dental & Vision per the attached RFP written documentation (Phase I) tabulation and interview scores (Phase II) tabulation as having the highest average score and best RFP meeting written specifications.

Term of Contract: This is a three (3)-year contract, renewable annually at the mutual agreement of the parties. The first-year term will be January 1, 2008 – December 31, 2008.

Notations and Exceptions: Proposals from Cigna Healthcare, Dental Decisions, and United Concordia were disqualified at the RFP opening for failure to provide mandatory signed bid sheets. Proposal from Humana Dental Insurance was disqualified at the RFP opening for failure to provide mandatory signed Addenda #1 and #2.

The RFP solicited three (3) separate options: Option 1, DHMO/PPO equivalent to or better than plans currently utilized by the District; Option 2, PPO plan only; Option 3, proposer choice of new plan(s) to be offered. All options in Phase I were independently evaluated by the Dental Sub-Committee members, with scores totaled and averaged by option. At a meeting of the full Insurance Committee on June 28, 2007, it was determined that interviews for Phase II should be held regarding Options 1 and 3. Option 2 was eliminated with cost being higher than Board-budgeted amounts.

Notations & Exceptions, continued: Interviews were held by the Sub-Committee on July 11, 2007 with the four (4) highest-ranked proposers for Options 1 and 3. The Committee verified that the District had received all companies' best and final offers regarding pricing and terms before interview results were scored. Phase II interview scores were totaled and averaged by option, and per the RFP specifications were added to the Phase I scores for a final total score. SafeGuard Dental & Vision was the highest-ranked company for both Options 1 and 3. After discussion, the Committee voted to recommend Option 1, DHMO/PPO, to the full Insurance Committee. The Insurance Committee endorsed this recommendation at its meeting on July 12, 2007.

The plans offered by SafeGuard have been confirmed as offering the same or better benefits to District employees. The cost to employees will be lower for the majority of the most heavily-utilized dental services. Reference attached documentation from Ms. Mary Tillman, Director of Employee Benefits and Risk Management (EBARM) for information regarding plan benefits and anticipated costs. The final cost to the Board is forecast to be lower than currently expended, but cannot be definitively stated until a contract with United School Employees of Pasco is finalized.

We are asking for Board approval of this choice of vendor, which will permit EBARM to begin the transition from the current District provider, CompBenefits, and prepare for open enrollment in the fall.

Offers from the vendors listed herein are the only offers received on a timely basis as of the specified date and time. All other offers submitted in response to this solicitation, if any, are hereby rejected as late.

Bids Evaluated By:

Rick Kurtz, Director of Food, Nutrition and Distribution Services

Kevin Shibley, Supervisor of Employee Relations

Robert Benjamin, USEP Representative

Patti Bartz, Employee Benefits Specialist

Cheryl Ganci, Employee Benefits Specialist

Mary Tillman, Director of Employee Benefits and Risk Management, served as the non-voting Chair of the committee

Bids Prepared By:

Arlene Zimney, CPPB, C.P.M., Buyer

Allan Waters, CPCU, Waters Risk Management (District Employee Benefits Consultant)

Reviewed and Authorized By:

Kendra Goodman, CPPB, Purchasing Agent

DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD OF PASCO COUNTY RFP TABULATION

Date of Opening: May 17, 2007 @ 2:30 pm						
Dental Services	Ameritas Life Insurance Corp.	Assurant Employee Benefits	CompBenefits	Delta Dental Insurance Co.	Florida Combined Life Insurance Co.	Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.
RFP 08-014-AZ OPTION 1: DHMO/PPO EQUAL TO CURRENT COVERAGE	475 Falbrook Blvd.	2323 Grand Blvd.	100 Mansell Ct. E., Ste 400	258 Southhall Lane, Ste 350	5011 Gate Parkway, Bldg 200, Ste 300	4010 Boy Scout Blvd.
** BOARD MEETING JULY 24, 2007**	Lincoln, NE 68521	Kansas City, MO 64108	Roswell, GA 30076	Maitland, FL 32751	Jacksonville, FL 32256	Tampa, FL 33607
Cost	22.90	22.50	25.40	20.95	23.40	34.00
Coverage	12.00	15.20	16.20	15.70	12.20	13.50
Providers	8.40	13.40	15.20	12.20	10.80	15.00
Service	7.60	7.40	6.60	8.00	4.40	7.40
Stability	4.80	4.60	3.80	4.80	5.00	4.60
References	4.93	4.18	4.08	4.73	4.44	4.92
<u>TOTAL PHASE I</u>	60.63	67.28	71.28	66.38	60.24	79.42
<u>PHASE II: INTERVIEWS</u>			37.20			25.00
<u>GRAND TOTAL</u>			108.48			104.42

DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD OF PASCO COUNTY RFP TABULATION

Date of Opening: May 17, 2007 @ 2:30 pm				
Dental Services	SafeGuard Dental & Vision	Standard Insurance Co.	United Healthcare	
RFP 08-014-AZ OPTION 1: DHMO/PPO EQUAL TO CURRENT COVERAGE	3410 Henderson Blvd., Ste 300	4350 West Cypress, Ste 920	13621 NW 12th St.	
** BOARD MEETING JULY 24, 2007**	Tampa, FL 33609	Tampa, FL 33607	Sunrise, FL 33323	
				RANKING ORDER FOR INTERVIEWS:
Cost	36.60	DID	31.20	1) Safeguard
Coverage	14.60	NOT	14.40	2) Metropolitan Life
Providers	13.80	PROPOSE	10.40	3) CompBenefits
Service	7.40		4.40	4) United Healthcare
Stability	3.00		4.60	5) Assurant
References	4.82		4.23	6) Delta Dental
				7) Ameritas
				8) Fla. Combined Life (BCBS)
				Standard: Did not propose
TOTAL PHASE I	80.22		69.23	
PHASE II: INTERVIEWS	46.80			
GRAND TOTAL	127.02			

DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD OF PASCO COUNTY RFP TABULATION

Date of Opening: May 17, 2007 @ 2:30 pm						
Dental Services	Ameritas Life Insurance Corp.	Assurant Employee Benefits	CompBenefits	Delta Dental Insurance Co.	Florida Combined Life Insurance Co.	Metropolitan Life Insurance Co.
RFP 08-014-AZ OPTION 3: VARIOUS OPTIONS FROM PROPOSERS	475 Falbrook Blvd.	2323 Grand Blvd.	100 Mansell Ct. E., Ste 400	258 Southhall Lane, Ste 350	5011 Gate Parkway, Bldg 200, Ste 300	4010 Boy Scout Blvd.
BOARD MEETING JULY 24, 2007	Lincoln, NE 68521	Kansas City, MO 64108	Roswell, GA 30076	Maitland, FL 32751	Jacksonville, FL 32256	Tampa, FL 33607
Cost	18.95		30.80	21.35	23.73	
Coverage	7.40	DID	18.20	10.60	11.60	DID
Providers	18.20	NOT	17.40	8.40	12.00	NOT
Service	7.60	PROPOSE	6.60	8.00	4.40	PROPOSE
Stability	4.80		3.80	4.80	5.00	
References	4.93		4.08	4.73	4.44	
<u>TOTAL PHASE I</u>	61.88		80.88	57.88	61.17	
<u>PHASE II: INTERVIEWS</u>			38.20			
<u>GRAND TOTAL</u>			119.08			

DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD OF PASCO COUNTY RFP TABULATION

Date of Opening: May 17, 2007 @ 2:30 pm				
Dental Services	SafeGuard Dental & Vision	Standard Insurance Co.	United Healthcare	
RFP 08-014-AZ OPTION 3: VARIOUS OPTIONS FROM PROPOSERS	3410 Henderson Blvd., Ste 300	4350 West Cypress, Ste 920	13621 NW 12th St.	
BOARD MEETING JULY 24, 2007	Tampa, FL 33609	Tampa, FL 33607	Sunrise, FL 33323	
				RANKING ORDER FOR INTERVIEWS:
Cost	27.20	32.60		
Coverage	17.20	15.00	DID	1) CompBenefits
Providers	14.20	14.20	NOT	2) Standard
Service	7.40	8.20	PROPOSE	3) SafeGuard
Stability	3.00	4.60		4) Ameritas
References	4.82	4.31		5) Delta Dental
				Did not propose:
				Assurant
<u>TOTAL PHASE I</u>	73.82	78.91		Metropolitan Life
				United Healthcare
<u>PHASE II: INTERVIEWS</u>	45.80	30.00		
<u>GRAND TOTAL</u>	119.62	108.91		